

Towards an Understanding of Stewardship in Macau

Mike Thompson

Macau Ricci Institute

v.220113

SUMMARY

The objective of this paper is to investigate how key opinion leaders representing business and non-business organisations at a senior level understand stewardship and its practice in Macau. A phronetic research approach was used in interviews with 14 leaders. Stewardship was not a term in normal use by interviewees but they provided their understanding and application to the term from which six stewardship behaviours were derived: CSR engagement; educational commitment; environmental preservation; social care; social care for non-residents; and ethical motivation. The findings shed light on how interviewees frame and weight the social and environmental challenges in Macau with the proactive and inherent sense of responsibility they feel to give as individuals and organisations to the wellbeing of the people of Macau. The study also shows how the gaming resorts practice stewardship as CSR which is associated with commercial aims of maintaining favour with the Macau government. Practical implications and avenues for future research are also developed.

CONTEXT FOR THE STUDY

Stewardship is, *ipso facto*, an expression of ethical behaviours of responsibility, accountability and activity in the management of resources for the common good. A variety of distinct framings of stewardship have emerged in recent years, each carrying particular disciplinary emphases and normative commitments (Enqvist et al, 2018, p.18). The concept of stewardship has been widely applied to many different forms of environmental stewardship: landscape, forestry, water, marine life and wildlife. Sustainability stewardship incorporates all forms of responsibility to promote human wellbeing and the protection of ecological systems.

Stewardship has been defined as the responsible use of resources that takes into account the interests of society, future generations and other species, as well as accepting significant accountability on the part of citizens to society (Worrell and Appleby, 2000). Hernandez (2012, p.174) defines stewardship as “the extent to which an individual willingly subjugates his or her personal interests to act in protection of others’ long-term welfare. Accordingly, stewardship behaviors are a type of prosocial action, intended to have a positive effect on other people.”

Enqvist et al's (2018) stewardship framework is based on three overlapping dimensions of stewardship: care, knowledge and agency. They demonstrate how these meanings relate to each other and how this can facilitate communication and collaboration between and among scholars and practitioners. "The framework recognises plurality, but may also act as a centering device by facilitating bridging and integration between different formulations of stewardship" (Enqvist et al, 2018, p.24).

RESEARCH APPROACH

Towards an understanding of stewardship in Macau is a dialogical social enquiry in which interviewees are engaged in a conversation with the overarching aim to analyse how they understood stewardship to benefit the social, environmental and economic wellbeing of Macau's citizens. The research method only involved an outline set of questions as prompts to help the interviewee to explore their own habitus and application of stewardship. As Schram has explained,

Understanding can never be grasped analytically; it has a holistic character.

Understanding also has intrinsic subjective elements requiring researchers to forgo a disinterested position of detachment and enter into dialogue with those they study.

Schram, 2012, p.18

This research approach makes allowance for the researcher to report their sense of themes expressed beyond the words used. In this report, for example, key themes are suggested as a subjective interpretation of interviewee comments and marked out as such.

The interview methods of phronetic social science ("Social Practice Wisdom" or "phronesiology") were adopted for this study. As with other forms of grounded theory research, phronetic social science does not conform to other traditional schools of social science enquiry but is more akin to ethnographic research methods comprising observations and interviews and, according to Schram (2012), "incorporates imagination into the analysis through the researcher's interpretation of the data." Phronetic social science puts the emphasis not on particular research methods or types of data, but on producing research that can enhance phronesis by increasing understanding in specific contexts as opposed to questing after the ghost of an abstract knowledge of law-like processes.

Therefore, phronetic social science calls for social scientists to revise their standards for acceptable research methodologies, re-incorporating context-sensitive research, such as case studies that help social actors learn to appreciate the complexities of social relations and practice various social crafts more effectively. Rooney (2013) believes that the Social Practice Wisdom approach gives a better set of research insights by "Being clear about the roles and relevance of one's dispositions and their recursive relationship with habitus, including cultural artefacts like knowledge and values."

Each interviewee is an influential organisational leader in Macau from business or civil society organisations. The interviewees were selected on the criteria of Sen's (2009) criteria¹ for social choice reasoning: "Membership Entitlement" meaning that the KOL is directly involved in social engagement, policy-making or business decisions that impact Macau society; or, "Enlightenment Relevance", meaning that the KOL can bring important insights and discernment into an evaluation whether or not they are a directly involved party.

Interviewees represented four business and civil society sectors: gaming resorts, SMEs, educators and not-for-profit institutions (Caritas de Macau and the Diocese de Macau). Apart from the limitations of a small interviewee sample, the survey is currently incomplete without a representative of the Macau government or departments. The full list of interviewees is set out in Appendix One and quotations from interviewees in this paper have been marked by initialising the interviewee's full name.

The survey was comprised of 14 in-depth interviews conducted online to explore and develop three foundational questions:

1. What does stewardship mean to you?
2. What are the experiences and illustrations of your organisation's engagement in stewardship / CSR?
3. What values and principles motivate you and your organization to engage in social and environmental projects (stewardship) in Macau?

Each interviewee reflected their experiences and insights into stewardship combining personal and organisational and sector perspectives. The interviews were recorded and transcribed for textual analysis.

EXPLAINING STEWARDSHIP

Stewardship: an unfamiliar concept

For most interviewees the concept of stewardship was not a familiar term, but for many it is understood as a form of CSR:

I think not many people understand the concept of stewardship and CSR here. I think it is all about accountability...the planning and management of resource. PP

¹ "A person's voice may count either because her interests are involved, or because her reasoning and judgment can enlighten a discussion. Also, a person's judgement may be seen as important either because she is one of those parties directly involved (this may be called 'membership entitlement'), or because the person's perspective and the reasons behind it bring important insights and discernment intuition into an evaluation, and there is a case for listening to the assessment whether or not the person is a directly involved party (this can be called 'enlightenment relevance')." Sen, A. (2009). *The Idea of Justice*, London, Penguin, p.108.

I search a bit about what is stewardship and I think there is a slight difference between CSR and stewardship...and in my experience, it could be the exchange of resource, but seen as CSR is on top of this, meaning we have a principle of profit. VM

The word is not a common word, right? It simply means responsible use or responsible care, so it links with a with a corporate social responsibility. KN

In my own work I've used it only once or twice, but it was in regards to making managerial decisions... for stewardship to take root in any society, especially in Macau, its people need to remember about the poverty of the past. DD

SA understands stewardship as parental responsibility for the family and supporting the development of employees:

I demonstrated my stewardship by setting up the relevant organisation cultures, making essential corporate/organisational strategies, and providing trainings and mentoring to my fellow workers. I also devoted a lot of time in Family Stewardship by giving my children role plays of how to behave as a responsible and respectable citizen.

Role-related stewardship

Interviewees interpreted stewardship in relation in the way that they personally viewed their professional role and responsibility. There was particular mention on the importance of, primarily education and the wellbeing and supporting the career development of their employees. HB expressed stewardship as a sense of responsibility through his professional role as founder and editor of the *Macau Post* in objective news reporting and the use of plain English as education for readers. SL emphasised the responsibility she felt to help others to improve themselves and particularly to subsidise professional training for her employees.

The four educational interviewees, whilst acknowledging the personal responsibility dimension of stewardship in making decisions, uniquely gave a much wider societal interpretation to their understanding of stewardship as a responsibility of trust to manage resources and heritage, and to provide a sense of moral consciousness for the long term good of the community. DD thought that stewardship “encapsulates a broad ideal of what we're trying to do, but at the same time it makes it more personally relevant.” In the words of AA, it is

A sense that everything that we do is sustainable. It's self-contained as much as possible... it means that you have to be able to stand on your own before being able to support others... It's for the benefit not only of the local community, but also the wider community or even at the global level...We are all part of a broad network with the Federation for International Federation of Catholic Universities. So, there's a circumstance of shared value.

Particular applications of stewardship in Macau were suggested by the educationalists as:

- Respect for individual's rights and for their voice to be heard;
- Acting for the wellbeing of the community as a whole;
- Addressing the negative effects of addictive gambling such as mental health;
- The interdependencies of communities and the decision makers and the need to deal in an honest and straight forward way, and,
- Adopting a long-term view when making commercial deals.

The Government of Macau and Stewardship

Most respondents appeared ambivalent about defining the role and responsibility of the Macau government in stewardship. CTF, was an exception believing that the Macau government is the main Steward: "As the big companies, like the casinos, always follow government policy closely and other SMEs will follow. Therefore, government policies are the main part of the stewardship...especially the DSEDJ (Macau Gov Education and Youth Development Bureau)."

Different views were expressed regarding the responsibility of the government towards non-resident workers. JH believes that the government has "too many things to do to take care of the local people because a lot of the local people have lost their jobs too so they have to put all...the resources to help the local people" with training and subsidies. HB also felt that the government priority is to look after local residents first. But he felt that basic social worker pay is pretty under-developed and migrant workers from the Philippines and other South-east Asian countries are struggling, and he thought that "things could and should be improved". SL is clear that "those who are unable to fish should be looked after by the government."

SA felt that the government should roll out stimulus policies, "but has to educate and help the citizens in adjusting to the new normals too. Unfortunately, in Macau, the government has not devoted enough efforts to help the citizens to stand on their own two feet."

But the overall mood of the interviewees is reflected in PP's words: "At this moment the government focus is to support the local people". He felt that the government trusted Caritas to care for "those people who are facing difficulties". PP believes that civil society agents, such as Caritas, should help the government to address social issues especially for the unemployed and neglected groups of people:

We are working together with the government departments and with different NGOs. We try to mobilise local citizens to think about the needs and the problems of people with different needs, including non-resident workers in Macau.

SA felt that the demands on the government of managing responses to the Covid-19 pandemic require a change in people's "philosophy". He felt that people "cannot depend on the government anymore, they have to stand on their own two feet."

SM pointed out that the Macau government's objectives of social cohesion and becoming a moderately prosperous society are shaped "by the fact of 670,000 people living in such tiny

area” and the activities to improve water and air quality and the vision for Macau to become a Green City is the priority.

AB points to a certain level of government social care but notices that there are serious mental health problems in the population and that have led to “an excessive number of suicides”.

CTF thought that the government's policies were very important in assisting disadvantaged groups. He gave special education as an example of government attention.

STEWARDSHIP BEHAVIOURS

From an analysis of the interviewee textual corpora six behaviours, or dimensions, of stewardship were derived:

1. CSR engagement;
2. Educational commitment;
3. Environmental preservation;
4. Social care;
5. Social care for non-residents; and,
6. Ethical motivation.

Figure 1 is an estimate of the weight given to these stewardship behaviours by interviewees in the four professional sectors.

Figure 1: Stewardship dimension relevance to professional sector

		<i>Professional Sectors</i>			
		Gaming Resorts	SMEs	Educators	Caritas / Diocese
Stewardship Dimensions	CSR engagement				
	Educational commitment				
	Environmental preservation				
	Social care				
	Social care for non-residents				
	Ethical motivation				

Excerpts from the interviews, commentary and key themes to support each of the stewardship behaviours is set out in the subsequent sections.

1. CSR Engagement

HB was one of ten interviewees who associate CSR engagement by gaming resorts with stewardship: "Casino companies have shown quite a degree of corporate responsibility during the crisis." A study by IAG of the CSR initiatives in 2020-21 by the "Big 6" Macau concessionaires on their amount to 320 CSR initiatives at a minimum. Community engagement and engagement represented 48 per cent of 89 separate initiatives (Blaschke, 2021). Interviewees referred mainly to gaming resort CSR engagements which supported social and educational causes in Macau. SL cites Galaxy Macau as a company who hire people with learning difficulties. One interviewee pointed out the way in which some of the leading resorts demonstrated stewardship in caring for the employees in practical and pastoral ways.

VM has observed a change over the last four years by the gaming operators:

They started to pull promotions and started to practice their own CSR....and as a gaming media, IAG, we report actively on CSR. We can use our media impact to make people understand better CSR....I think the gaming industry in Macau is like a role model. When they do something it is more obvious because they're big, they're big company, so other local company when they see it, they will follow. So in effect you can be seen as a leader and promoter of CSR in Macau.VM

One interviewee pointed to one gaming resort's initiative to educate small enterprises on cost and procurement management to be profitable,

Two interviewees questioned the motivation of the casino operators in their CSR programmes noting that it was only after the chief executive of Macau promised to remember any help given by the gaming resorts that "operators started to really rethink what they should do" such as giving hotel rooms for covid isolation regulations. They relate casino operator CSR activity as a means of achieving a renewal of the concessionaire licences when current licences expire in June 2022.

A lot of companies speak about CSR, but it's more of a PR exercise. The one source of all their actions, is to gain political favour to extend their gaming licenses....That's the way companies need to survive...(Anon)

*If they don't play part in supporting the local community order as visible as possible then they will miss out the chance of renewing their licenses in 2022...They're not bothered about the people, really. They're just doing it because they want the license in 2022.
(Anon)*

According to Shou-Tsung Wu and Yeong-Shyang Chen, (2015), "most studies have shown that casino gambling may be correlated with the following social deviations: domestic violence, divorce, bankruptcy, drug and alcohol abuse, risky or illicit sexual behavior (especially prostitution), and problem gambling." However, only three interviewees alluded to the negative social impacts and consequences of gambling in Macau.

The nature of gaming can cause a gambling addiction and related social problems.VM

Gambling addiction and all the associated borderline...illegal activities or potentially illegal activities that have to do with human trafficking and prostitution. All these kinds of things exist in this city and they have health handles. This is a sub world of this city that sometimes the local citizens don't see. AB

No interviewees referred to CSR activities that directly address what AB refers to as illegal or potentially illegal activities and the social personal impacts.

SME entrepreneurs have supported what might be regarded as CSR but the motivation and drive for social engagement arises from their own personal convictions rather than a corporate strategy: Handkerchief Campaign (JH) and support for the disabled, the elderly and girls (SL).

CSR Engagement: Key Themes

1. To educate employees
2. To exercise care towards employees
3. To provide resources for social and environmental needs in the Community

2. Educational Commitment

Most interviewees referred to their sense of bearing an inter-generational educational responsibility to employees towards education but also to support educational institutions in Macau. One interviewee regarded the nurture of employees as a primary responsibility of business leaders.

As an entrepreneur, my responsibility is to help staff to take training courses...give them the time and subsidise the fees. SL

From a very strong line level to management level, there will be different educational programs and we are actually supporting the local community. anon

To parents, family education is very important. KN

The educators, the schools and the universities have a responsibility in the sense of forming the minds of the up-and-coming generations. By and large there is a relatively sensible job of that done both by the Catholic schools which educate 40% of the children in schools and those run by the Macau Chinese Schools Association. SM

CTF reported that private business sectors have donated to the St. Peter scholarships and supported the Diocese in providing special education for deaf students and kindergarten children with reading and writing issues. The gaming resorts have made donations to Diocesan schools but have operated as a partnership “more than just receiving donations” because of the “well-known reputation of Diocese's social and education work”. One interviewee felt that the gaming resorts could be more proactive the education of the whole workforce.

In DD's educational experience there is a gap in the teaching of philosophy, civilizations and humanities. He feels that humanities education in Macau should "become more embedded in our professional and cultural, social, cultural psyche" and relates this to educating people to the stewardship of wealth.

Educational Commitment: Key Themes

1. An instinctual sense of responsibility by all interviewees to support the educational development of the population directly or indirectly.
2. A higher-level educational aim for educational stewardship in mind-formation and humanities education.

3. Environmental Preservation

UNESCO granted Macau World Heritage status in 2005 covering 32 urban elements (including 23 monuments, one street, one garden and seven squares). The official title of the "Historic Centre of Macao" points out the fundamental importance of open spaces with architecture of Macau's urban heritage. Vong (2008) reported that the residents of Macau attributed the following negative environmental impacts to the development of local casinos: worsening traffic congestion, air pollution, and overcrowding.

The link between stewardship and the environment was not a strong feature in the interviews although CTF observed that "You will find that many businesses are so suddenly environmentally friendly."

Indeed, only SL referred to the air pollution problem and none referred to the preservation of built heritage. The main environmental topics were the challenges of managing plastic waste and the future ideal of a Green Macau with aquaponic farming. The integrated resorts were cited as being *at the* forefront of the no plastic / single-use plastic initiative in the city.

The Macau Government expect us to hit the Singapore Green cover targets, I think the figure is 140%. So, if you're going to develop an area of 10,000 square feet, you better develop 10,400 square feet of green space... which is putting the architects through their paces. SM

Citizens are genuinely trying to respond, regardless of whether it is to take action in regard to plastic bags or straws. The community does react once they learn about the different initiatives and they do want to make the city a greener society, and so do I, especially in the corporate sector. TM

This has become a very good place for social and environmental experiments, so Macau could play a very important role in, you know, testing and pioneering and championing some. We have now the introduction of new aquaponics.... farming on water on a low

space...there's a lot of work being done on food. Recycling in some of the casinos together with some international organisations. AB

It was noteworthy that none of the interviewees volunteered the stewardship of Macau's built heritage. Macau's built heritage is founded on its multicultural vibrancy and historical character of toleration and receptiveness to external influences but "gambling-related sectors and the potential threat of lucrative developments causing irreparable damage to Macau's variegated past, ultimately leading to an unfortunate paradox wherein the hand that fed was also the hand that killed" (McCartney and Nadkarni, 2003).

Environmental Preservation: Key Themes

1. Green cover targets
2. Environmental experimentation such as aquaponic farming
3. Plastic use management

4. Social care

The single core behaviour that was expressed by all interviewees through varying narrative accounts and statements on values and responsibilities was *care*: for young people, for seniors, for employees and for the development of Macau's citizens. SL, as president of the International Ladies Club, facilitates visits to the elderly at elderly care centres and has raised funds to help the disabled and mental health development.

CTF and SL both pointed out the gaps between the disadvantaged people in Macau expressed by SL as the gap between the rich and the poor. "Of course, there are resources, but it is a group of disadvantaged groups that the government has not been able to fully satisfy" (CTF). Two interviewees mentioned the work of Caritas in helping to meet the basic needs of unemployed people in Macau and to the support given by one of the gaming resorts.

SL believed more needed to be done to address issues facing the poor to "make the community more in harmony and contented... Those who are unable to fish should be looked after by the government." She suggested that the SMEs should be supported and developed in Macau to create new jobs that are not just "light-skilled only or with small stores".

Social Care: Key Themes

1. A just use of resources for the common good, local and global communities
2. Community philanthropic concerns and care for seniors, ex-offenders, for those affected by physical and mental disabilities and the need to reskill middle-aged women,
3. Preserving the past for the future

5. Social care for non-residents

Despite the strong duty of care espoused, a number of interviewees pointed to a gap between the care given to Macau's citizens and that given to migrant workers. The gap was most apparent during the height of the Covid-19 pandemic when migrant workers were unable to work and were unable to return home due to flight restrictions.

DD sees the need for a change in the employment law for migrant workers. According to the law, whenever a migrant worker is paid off, they must return to their own home. Unemployed migrant workers have not been able to return home and local residents are willing to hire them but can't. One interviewee wondered about the extent to which people in Macau felt a responsibility to care for unemployed workers. Caritas was referenced by interviewees as an organisation active in garnering support from local volunteers to help distribute food vouchers and donate food.

We had over 180,000 migrants working in Macau...but now about 20,000 are unemployed. Their contract was terminated but they cannot go back to their own countries. We provide some assistance to some 2,000 people. We are taking care of the migrants who are in need in Macau. PP

The blind spot seems to be about how you treat non-Macau workers. There's a very clear hierarchy between people from Macau, people from the mainland, and people from elsewhere. And I don't mean Caucasian people from elsewhere. I mean, Filipinos, Indonesians, Vietnamese. They seem to be much less concerned about treating those employees well than protecting the rights of Macau employees. SM

But a lot of people and organisations are helping...I will connect with Caritas and with other organizations similar to Caritas, and then we will bring all these food items to these people....My company helped to send the Vietnamese home. We did that without charging the clients without charging the employees. We did all this for free. JH

It's the differential between the kind of support that you get as someone that is a Macau ID holder and someone that is not. It's not compatible with the actual impact that these people have in society. Both human beings working well in the same place, contributing equally to the benefit of all as part of the community. AB

Social Care for Non-residents: Key Themes

1. A sense of responsibility by all to address the needs of migrant workers, especially the unemployed.
2. Concern that an underclass has been created in Macau and that this is unjust.

6. Ethical Motivation

Interviewees closely related stewardship with tacit ethical values: “How to manage something in an ethical way” (KN). SM believes that the core meaning of stewardship is the practice of justice:

I think it's about acting justly, actually. I think it's a word that expresses the concept of justice in the use of resources, physical resources, financial resource, human resources.

So I see stewardship as being a mental or attitudinal disposition to act justly. SM

Similarly, JH regards stewardship as “the responsibility that organisations have to use resources in a in a good way for the good of other people...People in Macau are concerned a lot on the social needs of the people.”

TM emphasised that the individual is the primary responsible steward: “I think accountability is often brushed aside, but we all need to be accountable for what we say and what we do. And then certainly being responsible for our actions.... being responsible citizens and doing our best for the community that we live in...I think the community genuinely does care.”

KN made a link between stewardship and the ideal of the common good primarily regarded as the responsibility for the staff to build trust with its customers and its partners. However, she reported a more philosophical expression of what she understood to be the common good: “everybody is good, everybody can be so wise and everybody can be enlightened.”

For DD, stewardship encapsulates both a broad ideal and personal responsibility and “is most intimately related the trove of values that one has to tap in order to make decisions.”

When we come home, we are stewards of our children and of our home, and so it does have this very personal level content. preserve the past for those who will inherit what we have at the present in the future.... Stewardship also talks about the future: to preserve the past for those who will inherit what we have at the present in the future.

You're burdened by the past and making sure that you don't screw up what you've been given. DD

The sense of wanting to contribute to Mekanese society was expressed by interviewees in a different way. SA expressed that he is a “great believer in business ethics and Confucian entrepreneurship”. He expressed his motivation as a Christian mission in which he was helped by the Holy Spirit:

It is my wish that I can contribute... I want to work for the society because I'm a part.

That's why I formed a small and medium independent association to help them...in case they have any difficulty in carrying on their business... In service to the Macau community, I want to play an important role in showing to the Macau citizens the importance of the Christian church and God's love and care for His faithfulness.

SM referred to the long-term game which “involves loyalty from the employer to the employee and they're not there to be used or to be exploited.” He also explained how the long-term nature of commercial relationships in Macau required for fair dealing:

I want the best deal in such a way that I can deal with this person tomorrow. So there's a premium on those culturally highly prized notions of sincerity and societal harmony and face. Demonstrates integrity and sincerity and honesty and straightforwardness and doesn't involve putting a fast one over on him or me.

Others also acknowledged the importance corporate ethical behaviour and ensuring the wellbeing of their people. The fusion of professional morality with corporate ethics as stewardship was defined by JH:

Stewardship is the responsibility that many people many organisations might have to use resources in a in a good way for the good of other people... I have the values right, you know and all the philosophy there and it does help me shape my own company culture and also the decision making.

She highlighted ethical behaviours with the nurturing a company's growth beyond economic measures:

I have the values right, you know, and all the philosophy there, and it does help me shape my own company culture. And also, the decision making and the way we do things and also how we grow our own company in terms of not just about business. JH

The connection between stewardship and ethics was disclosed in many comments made by the interviewees. Responsibility, accountability, integrity, honesty, sincerity, social harmony and solidarity were variously expressed as foundational drivers for stewardship behaviours:

- *Values not money – no shortcuts to make money. Don't cheat, its's not sustainable. SL*
- *To be honest and to take the interest of the community as a whole into account. HB*
- *Integrity and sincerity and honesty and straightforwardness. There's a premium on those culturally highly prized notions of sincerity and societal harmony. SM*
- *This trove of values that one has to tap in order to make decisions is very tricky because you you've got community values, you've got national values and then you've got personal values as well. DD*
- *We all need to be accountable for what we say and what we do... being responsible citizens and doing our best for the community that we live in. TM*
- *The Guangxi concept where in China you make business with the people that you know...the solidarity between people is quite a lot to do with the kind of issues that have to do with multiculturalism and ethnic differences. AB*
- *By helping the individuals, who would then be able to help his/her family and improve the whole society. We care for the ones in difficulties. PP*
- *So essentially it comes down to looking after people when it's about the moral values. Anon*

- *Be kind, don't cheat - no shortcuts. SL*
- *The Christian teaching is to love your neighbours...integrity, active ethics and social responsibilities. SA*

Ethical Motivation: Key Themes

1. Stewardship ethical behaviours: responsibility, accountability, integrity, honesty, sincerity, social harmony and solidarity.
2. Role-related responsibility to give back from privilege and to manage with ethics.
3. A sense of a shared good and communitarian solidarity.

DISCUSSION

This study is limited to the views of 14 key opinion leaders in Macau representing media, large companies, SMEs and educational and charitable institutions (see Appendix One). Their voices reflect their habitus and experience of life and work in Macau. Perhaps the most significant and absent voice to the study was the Government of Macau and further research is required to understand the stewardship behaviour of government and the role that the government sees for itself in elevating the kinds of behaviours identified by the interviewees in this study.

In contrast to agency theory, stewardship theory draws from sociology and psychology to offer an alternate view in which organizational actors see greater long-term utility in other- focused prosocial behaviour than in self-serving, short-term opportunistic behaviour (Hernandez, 2012, p.112). This current study supports stewardship theory through the espoused praxis of stewardship by the interviewees. Even for those working for large gaming resorts the stewardship instinct was considerably more evident than the traditional agency paradigm. Interviewees recognised the long-term best interests of different communities in Macau and their own role in supporting those interests.

The findings of this research do not suggest any philosophical, classical or religious references or background. Rather the interviewees suggested personal ethical motivations and ideals inherent in the prosaic practice of solidarity and engagement predominantly in meeting the social and educational needs of different sectors in Macanese society. Environmental stewardship was alluded to as a periphery behaviour and the stewardship of built heritage did not feature at all.

This study suggests avenues for future research could be developed to test the validity and ranking of the six behaviours identified and a larger research study may identify sub-sets that build a more detailed and comprehensive picture of how stewardship is understood and practiced by the people of Macau. Further research is required to analyse how stewardship motivations might work by those in the departments of the Government of Macau and how social, educational and environmental policies are embedded with stewardship principles beyond political and agency necessities.

APPENDIX ONE

List of interviewees

The Macau Ricci Institute is grateful to each person who gave time and thought to the interview process.

	Interviewees	Organisation	Position
1	Mr. Chan Teng Fong	Diocese of Macau - Commission of Catholic Education	Director
2	Ms. Jacinta Ho	JC Human Resources Consulting	Managing Director
3	Ms. Sophie Lei	TIO Investment Limited	CEO
4	Mr. Timothy McClenahan	English for Asia	Co-founder
5	Prof. Don Dioko	Institute for Tourism Studies (IFT) Macau	Professor
6	Mr. Harald Bruning	Macau Post	Director and Chief Editor
7	Ms. Victoria Man	IAG	Director of Events and Projects
8	Prof. Stephen Morgan	USJ	Rector
9	Mr Paul Pun	Caritas Macau	Secretary General
10	Ms Karen Neng	Moxlink Technology Limited	General Manager
11	Prof Alvaro Barbosa	USJ	Vice Rector
12	Mr Stanley Au	Delta Bank Asia and the President of the association of SMEs in Macau.	Chairman
13	Anonymous respondent 1	Major integrated resort in Macau	Senior role
14	Anonymous respondent 2	Major integrated resort in Macau	Senior role

REFERENCES

- Blaschke, B. (2021, 6 September). Macau's CSR Success. *Inside Asian Gaming*.
<https://www.asgam.com/index.php/2021/09/06/macaus-csr-success/>
- Enqvist, J. P., West, S., Masterson, V. A., Haider, L. J., Svedin, U., & Tengö, M. (2018). Stewardship as a boundary object for sustainability research: linking care, knowledge and agency. *Landscape and Urban Planning*, 179, 17-37
- Hernandez, M. (2012). Toward an understanding of the psychology of stewardship. *Academy of Management Review*, 37:2, 172–193.
- McCartney, G., & Nadkarni, S. (2003, December). Heritage versus gaming: Odds on winning a piece of the tourist pie. In The second DeHaan Tourism Management Conference: Developing Cultural Tourism.
- Rooney, D. (2013). Empirical Wisdom Research: A Community Approach. In M. Thompson & D. Bevan, (Eds.), *Wise management in organisational complexity* (pp. 34-52). Palgrave Macmillan.
- Sen, A. (2009). *The Idea of Justice*, Penguin.

- Shou-Tsung W. & Yeong-Shyang C. (2015). The social, economic, and environmental impacts of casino gambling on the residents of Macau and Singapore, *Tourism Management*, 48, 285-298
- Thompson, M. J. (2016). How managers understand wisdom in decision-making. In Küpers, W., & Gunlaugson, O. (Eds.), *Wisdom Learning: Perspectives on Wising-Up Business and Management Education*, (pp.211-228). Taylor & Francis.
- Schram, S. (2012). Phronetic social science: An idea whose time has come. In B. Flyvbjerg, T. Landman & S. Schram, S. (Eds.), *Real social science: Applied phronesis*, (pp.15-26) Cambridge University Press.
- Vong, F. C. K. (2008). Influence of personal factors on Macau residents' gaming impact perceptions *Gaming Research & Review Journal*, 12 (1/2), pp. 15-28.
- Worrell, R. & Appleby, M.C. (2000). Stewardship of natural resources: definitions, ethical and practical aspects. *Journal of Agricultural and Environmental Ethics*, 12, 263– 277.